BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631452 9

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S. M. Makuch

Volume 1

1983 - 1984

with the assistance of

Philip Tunley

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY

MAR 6 1984

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S. M. Makuch

Volume 1

1983 - 1984

with the assistance of

Philip Tunley

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/municipalplannin01maku

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

CHAPTER I

Introduction 1

Jarvis, Acting for a Developer 2

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 6

Dupre, Intergovernmental Finance in Ontario: A Provincial-Local Perspective 11

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 16

Notes and Questions 21

CHAPTER II

THE ORGANIZATION OF MUNICIPALITIES

Introduction 22

A. Approaches to Municipal Organization 23

Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government 23

Note 29

1. Municipal Council 30

Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto UPDATE 30

Note 30

2. The Executive 31

(i) The Mayor 31

Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 31

(ii) Reforming the Executive 32

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 32

3.	The Board of Control - Executive Committee	34
	Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government	34
	Notes	36
	Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System	36
	Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration	38
4.	The Manager Plan	40
	Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System	40
	Notes and Questions	43
5.	Council-City Commissioner System	44
	Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government	44
6.	Standing Committees	45
	Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making	45
	Note	46
7.	Approaches to Reform	46
(i)	The Basic Assumption - Policy v. Administration	46
	Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration	46
	Hickey, Decision-Making Processes in Ontario's Local Governments	50
(ii)	The Winnipeg Experience	56
	Proposal for Urban Reorganization in the Greater Winnipeg Area	56
	Note	59
	Cook & Feldman, Approaches to Local Government Reform in Canada: The Case of Winnipeg	60
	Jacobs, The Death and Life of Great American Cities	61
(iii)	A New Suggestion for Toronto	63
	City of Toronto Neighbourhood Services Work Group, Report	63

B. The Reorganization of Municipalities 67

1. The Need for Reform 67

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, In Search of Balance: Canada's Intergovernmental Experience 67

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, Alternative Approaches to Governmental Reorganization in Metropolitan Areas 69

2. Distribution of Responsibilities 74

a) The Metropolitan Toronto Example 74

b) Regional Government 75

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 75

Notes 82

3. The Problems With Reorganization 82

(i) Boundaries 82

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 83

(ii) Special Purpose Bodies 84

Bureau of Municipal Research, "The 101 Governments of Metro Toronto" 84

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 93

Note 94

(iii) Representation 94

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 94

(iv) Intra Regional Conflict 100

Simpson, City Loses Important Votes at First Meeting of Metro Council 100

Globe & Mail, City Decides on Legal Fight over Spadina 100

Note 101

Globe & Mail, York Joins City in Opposing Spadina Paving 101

Note 103

Weinstein, "The Effect of the Federal Reapportionment Decisions on Municipal Government" 103

(v) An Alternative: The Winnipeg Experience 104

Proposals for Urban Reorganization in the Greater Winnipeg Area 104

Globe & Mail, Assessing the Plan to Reform Winnipeg's Government 107

CHAPTER III

LOCAL GOVERNMENT FINANCING

Introduction 114

A. Introduction 115

1. Municipal Finance Generally 115

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 115

Local Government Finance in Ontario (Ministries of Treasury and Economics & Intergovernmental Affairs) 119

2. The Property Tax 127

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 127

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 129

B. Restraints on Municipal Finance 131

1. The Political Process 131

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and The Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 131

Statement by Paul V. Godfrey, President Canadian Federation of Mayors and Municipalities 135

Notes 138

2. Legal Restraints 139

Re Corporation of the Township of Nepean 139

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 145

City of Toronto v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 151

Re Township of Westminster and City of London 154

Re Victoria Harbour Sewage Service 157

Lewis v. Town of Prescott 162

Note 163

C. Property Tax Assessment 164

1. Who is Liable for Property Taxation 164

2. What is Assessable Property 164

Northern Broadcasting Co. Ltd. v. Improvement District of Mountjoy 165

Notes and Questions 168

3. Exemptions from Taxation 169

(i) Crown Land 169

Re Delta Parking Systems Ltd. and Township of Toronto 169

Notes 171

(ii)	Indian Lands	172
(iii)	Places of Worship and Cemetaries	172
	Re Presbyterian Church Building Corp. and Assessment Comm. for Algoma	172
	Re Singh and City of Sudbury	176
	Note	181
(iv)	Public Education Institutions, Philanthropic or Religious Seminaries and Educational Seminaries	182
	Re McMaster University and City of Hamilton et al.	182
	Donald Piazezza Beauty Salon et al. v. Corporation of the Borough of North York	185
	Seafarers Training Institute v. Township of Williamsburg	188
	Notes	192
(v)	Public Hospitals, Highways, Municipal Property, Boy Scouts and Girl Guides and Industrial Farms	193
(vi)	Municipal Properties	194
	Toronto Transit Commission v. City of Toronto	194
	Notes	196
(vii)	Charitable Institutions	197
	Re Ina Grafton Homes and Township of East York	197
	Assessment Commissioner of the Village of Stouffville v. Mennonite Home Association of York County	200
(viii)	Children's Aid Societies, Scientific or Literary Institutions and Battle Sites	205

(ix)	Machinery and Equipment Used for Manufacturing or Farming Purposes	205
	The City of London v. John Labatt Ltd.	205
	Note	208
(x)	The Interpretation of "Property Of"	208
	Re Royal Ontario Museum and Assessment Commissioner for Region No. 10 et al.	208
	Re Markham York Hospital et al and Township of Markham	213
	Note	214
(xi)	Exceptions to Certain Exemptions	214
(xii)	Municipal Exemptions	215
(xiii)	Bonuses	215
	Re Whitton and City of Ottawa	215
	Note	216
4.	Valuation of Property	217
(i)	Market Value	217
	Ward, Market Value Re-Assessment	217
	Montreal v. Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada	224
	Assessment Commissioner of the York Assessment Office v. Office Speciality Ltd.	235
	Note	237
(ii)	Equity	238
	Joint Committee on Property Tax Reform Interim Report: The Present Property Tax System	238
	Re Empire Realty Co. Ltd. and Assessment Commissioner for Metro Toronto	240
	Note	250

Foxhead Inn Ltd. v. Regional Assessment Commission 250

Re York Condominium No. 26 551 The West Mall and Assessment Commissioner for the Borough of Etobicoke 251

Devald et al. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 16 et al. 255

Downtown Oshawa Property Owners' Association, Hovell Holdings Limited and Drew Estate v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region Number 13, The Corporation of the City of Ottawa 258

Regional Assessment Commissioners Region No. 2 et al. v. Ontario Steel Products Co. Ltd. 261

Notes 264

(iii) Special Provision for Farm Land 265

(iv) Special Provisions for Reforested Lands, Wood Lands and Orchards 266

(v) Special Provisions for Golf Courses 266

(vi) Other Special Provisions 266

5. Business Assessment 267

(i) Liability for Business Assessment - Carrying on a Business 267

Regional Assessment Commissioner v. Caisse Populaire de Hearst Ltée 267

Notes and Questions 271

Re Delta Parking Systems Ltd. and Township of Toronto 272

Re Saga Canadian Management Services Ltd. and City of Ottawa et al. 275

Note 284

Re Plumbing Mart 285

(ii) Rate of Business Assessment 288

Re United Trust Co. and City of Toronto 288

Notes and Questions 291

6. Appeals 292

Downtown Churchworkers Association of the Anglican Church of Canada and Dioceses of Toronto v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 7 et al. 293

D. Local Improvements and Special Assessment 300

E. Reform 301

Financing Development of Local Government in Ontario 301

Notes and Questions 302

Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 303

CHAPTER IV

JUDICIAL REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTION

Introduction 322

A. Constitutionality 323

(i) Distribution of Powers 323

Notes and Questions 325

(ii) The Charter of Rights and Freedoms 326

McCutcheon v. City of Toronto 326

Notes 342

B. Delegation 343

(i) To Employees 343

Russell v. The Corporation of Toronto 343

R. v. Sandler 344

R v. Campbell 347

(ii) To Council Committees 348

Simon v. Gastonguay et al. 348

(iii) To the Community 351

R. v. Sepanary 351

Re Davies and Village of Forest Hill 352

C. Express Authority 356

Morrison v. Kingston 356

Re Christie Taxi Ltd. and Doran 358

Notes 359

Ottawa Electric Light Co. v. Corporation of Ottawa 360

Re Weir et al. and The Queen 361

Re Pride Cleaners and Dyers 365

Note 368

Re Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton and Voyageur Colonial Ltd. et al. 368

Notes and Questions 371

The Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto Recommendations 373

D. Discrimination 375

Re Bunce and Town of Cobourg 375

R. v. Donald B. Allen Ltd. 377

City of Ottawa v. Royal Trust Co. 379

City of Verdun v. Sun Oil Co. Ltd. 383

Atkinson v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 386

E. Vagueness 388

City of Montreal v. Morgan 388

Note 391

F. The Impact of Provincial Policy 392

Re Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton and Township of Marlborough 392

R. v. Morin 395

A.G. for Ontario v. City of Mississauga 398

G. Unreasonableness 413

Kruse v. Johnson 413

Note 414

H. Geographic Limitations 414

R. v. Roy 415

Note 420

I. Bad Faith 421

Re Howard and City of Toronto 421

Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache 424

J. Technical Requirements 426

Re Whitton and City of Ottawa 426

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this course is to provide the student with a basic understanding of the workings of local government, the constraints within which municipalities operate, and in particular the planning powers of municipalities. Lawyers engaged in the practice of municipal law are often called upon to fill a number of roles: acting as counsel to municipal governments and preparing municipal legislation; handling suits for or against the municipal corporation; advising the municipality on finance and bond issues; assisting either the municipality or private citizen with planning or other policy matters; advising on municipal reorganization and intergovernmental relations. In any of these capacities it is important for the lawyer to have an understanding of the institutional, the financial and the legal framework within which municipalities function. An understanding of the municipal planning function is also crucial as it is one of the most important aspects of municipal authority.

The materials in this casebook survey a number of these important areas: municipal organization; problems in local government finance; judicial review of municipal powers; the role of the municipality in planning, the provincial role in planning and in particular the role of the Ontario Municipal Board as an administrative review agency. Official plans, zoning by-laws, and development agreements are important aspects of this examination. It is hoped that this course will provide both a broad perspective from which to view municipal government and planning and a narrower perspective from which specific legal problems particularly with respect to planning may be analyzed.

The theme of this course is that the purpose of local government is to ensure local political control over the delivery of local services and local planning decisions. The adequacy of present local government structures, and authority and the appropriateness of judicial and administrative review of local government action should be kept in mind.